BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 10631437 0

Cases on Evidence

(1989-90 Edition)

Volume I

(pp. 1-461)

Selected by Alan W. Mewett

These materials are intended for use in the Evidence Course of Professor Mewett in the Faculty of Law of the University of Toronto

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/casesonevidence01mewe

Cases on Evidence

(1989-90 Edition)

Volume I

(pp. 1-461)

Selected by Alan W. Mewett

These materials are intended for use in the Evidence Course of Professor Mewett in the Faculty of Law of the University of Toronto

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Statutes	Page No.
Charter of Rights	1
Canada Evidence Act	3
Evidence Act of Ontario	17
Chapter 1	33
Chapter 2	70
1. Introduction	
Batary v. A.G. Sask., [1965] S.C.R. 465	118
Bruno (1976), 27 C.C.C. (2d) 318	122
Pappajohn (1980), 14 C.R. (3d) 243	123
R. v. Whyte (1988), 42 C.C.C. (3d) 97	128
Oakes (1983), 2 C.C.C. (3d) 339	143
Holmes v. The Queen (1988), 41 C.C.C. (3d) 497	163
Morin v. R. (1989), 44 C.C.C. (3d) 193	180
Cloutier v. R. (1980), 48 C.C.C. (2d) 1	201
Morris (1984), 36, 36 C.R. (3d) 1	207
2. Competence, Compellability and Oaths	
Gosselin (1907), 7 C.C.C. 139	219
McConnell and Beer, [1968] S.C.R. 802	223
Vezeau, [1977] 2 S.C.R. 277	227
Hoskyn v. M.P.C., [1978] 2 W.L.R. 695	229
Bowles (1967), 50 C.R. 353	231
Sillars (1980), 12 C.R. (3d) 202	233
R. v. Czipps (1980), 12 C.R. (3d) 193	235
McLaughlin (1974), 24 C.R.N.S. 362	239
R. v. Walsh (1979), 45 C.C.C. (2d) 199	243
R. v. Gunewardene, [1951] 2 K.B. 600	248
Toohey v. M.P.C., [1965] A.C. 595	250
Regina v. Hawke (1975), 29 C.R.N.S. 1	254
Sankey v. The King (1927), 48 C.C.C. 97	259
R. v. Budin (1981), 58 C.C.C. (2d) 352 (Ont. C.A.)	262
Kendall v. The Queen, [1962] S.C.R. 469	264
3. Refreshing Memory	
McInroy and Rouse (1977), 5 C.R. (3d) 125	266
Regina v. Davey (1969), 6 C.R.N.S. 288	270

4. Credibility

(a) Expert Evidence

Wilband v. The Queen, [1967] 2 C.C.C. 6	274
Regina v. Rosik (1971), 13 C.R.N.S. 129	276
Regina v. Abbey (1982), 43 N.R. 30	286
Béland v. R. (1988), 60 C.R. (3d) 1 (S.C.C.)	294

(b) Enhancing Credibility

R. v. Clark (1984), 40 C.R. (3d) 183	311
Regina v. Kyselka, [1962] O.W.N. 164	318
Corke v. Corke, [1958] 1 All E.R. 224	320
Welstead v. Brown, [1952] 1 S.C.R. 3	322
Regina v. Rozich (1980), 10 C.R. (3d) 364	325
Regina v. Giraldi (1975), 28 C.C.C. (2d) 248	329
Regina v. Pangilinan (1988), 60 C.R. (3d) 188.	332

(c) Complaints in Sexual Cases

Sexual Offences Act	334
Timm v. The Queen (1981), 59 C.C.C. (2d) 396 (S.C.C.)	335
R. v. Page (1984), 40 C.R. (3d) 85	339

(d) Prior Inconsistent Statements

Deacon (1947), S.C.R. 531	345
McInroy and Rouse, [1979] 1 S.C.R. 588	347
Wawanesa v. Hanes, [1961] O.R. 495	353
Regina v. Milgaard (1971), 14 C.R.N.S. 34	357

(e) Prior Convictions

Criminal Code s. 593	362
D'Aoust (1902), 5 C.C.C. 407	362
Koufis v. The King (1941), S.C.R. 481	363
Regina v. St. Pierre (1974), 17 C.C.C. (2d) 489	365
Morris v. The Queen (1979), 43 C.C.C. (2d) 129	368
Regina v. Speid (1988), 42 C.C.C. (3d) 12	380
Corbett v. The Queen (1988), 41 C.C.C. (3d) 385	395

(f) Prior Sexual Conduct

Criminal Code ss. 246.6, 246.7 433

(g) Accused Attaching Own Credibility

Regina v. French (1978), 37 C.C.C. (2d) 201 434
Helpard v. R. (1979), 10 C.R. (3d) 76 439
Regina v. Dietrich (1970), 11 C.R.N.S. 129 442
Regina v. K. (1979), 47 C.C.C. (2d) 436 448

5. Character

Regina v. McNamara (1981) 56 C.C.C. (2d) 193 454
Guay v. The Queen (1978), 42 C.C.C. (2d) 536 462
Regina v. Taylor (1982), 35 O.R. (2d) 738 (Ont. C.A.) 464
Regina v. Glynn (1971), 15 C.R.N.S. 343 466
Regina v. Lupien (1970), 9 C.R. 165 467
Regina v. Lowery, [1973] 3 W.L.R. 235 472
Regina v. McMillan (1975), 29 C.R.N.S. 191 477
Regina v. Robertson (1975), 29 C.R.N.S. 141 482

6. Similar Fact Evidence

Criminal Code Section 312, 314(1)(b), 317, 318 484
Makin & The Attorney General for New South Wales [1894] A.C. 57 485
Regina v. Smith (1916), 11 Cr. Ap. Rep. 229 488
Sweitzer v. The Queen (1982), 68 C.C.C. (2d) 193 489
Director of Public Prosecutions & Boardman, [1975] A.C. 421 493
Leblanc v. The Queen (1975), 29 C.C.C. (2d) 97 497
Regina v. Straffen, [1952] 2 Q.B. 911 502
Regina v. Scopelliti (1982), 63 C.C.C. (2d) 481 505
Hoffman article, (1975), 91 L.Q.R. 193 512

7. Hearsay

(i) General

Myers v. D.P.P., [1965] A.C. 1001 521
Ares v. Venner, [1970] S.C.R. 608 526
Subramaniam, [1956] 1 W.L.R. 965 528
Wright v. Tatham (1837), 112 E.R. 488 530
Wysochan (1930), 54 C.C.C. 172 533
Wildman (1984), 14 C.C.C. (3d) 321 535
Ratten, [1972] A.C. 378 545

R. v. McKinnon 1989 70 C.R. (3d) 9 549

(ii) Res Gestae

Bedingfield (1879), 14 Cox C.C. 341 555
Gilbert (1907), 38 S.C.R. 284 557
Regina v. Hodd (1970), 1 C.C.C. (3d) 363 560
Regina v. Graham (1972), 7 C.C.C. (2d) 93 564
Regina v. Newton (1976), 34 C.R.N.S. 161 569
Regina v. Risby (1977), 32 C.C.C. (2d) 242 571
Regina v. Keeler (1978), 36 C.C.C. (2d) 8 572
Regina v. Clark (1983), 35 C.R. (3d) 357 575

(iii) Statements Against Interest

Donnelly v. U.S. (1913), 228 U.S. 243 591
Regina v. O'Brien (1977), 35 C.C.C. (2d) 209 593
Regina v. Pelletier (1978), 38 C.C.C. (2d) 515 596
Lucier v. The Queen (1982), 65 C.C.C. (2d) 150 598

(iv) Prior Proceedings

Criminal Code S.S. 643, 541 600
Walkerton v. Erdman (1894), 23 S.C.R. 352 601
Hollington v. Hewthorn (1943), 1 K.B. 587 604
Goody v. Odhams Press, [1967] 1 Q.B. 333 608
Gushue v. The Queen (1980), 50 C.C.C. (2d) 417 608
Grdic v. R. (1975), 19 C.C.C. (2d) 289 613
English v. Richmond, [1956] S.C.R. 383 621
Director of Public Prosecutions v. Humphrys, [1976] 2 All E.R. 497 624
R. v. Prince (1987), 30 C.C.C. (3d) 35 626
Kienapple v. The Queen (1974), 15 C.C.C. (2d) 524 634

(v) Bodily and Mental Condition

Youlden v. London Guarantee & Accident Co. (1912), 260 L.R. 75 636
Mutual Life v. Hillmon (1892), 145 U.S. 285 638
Regina v. Wainwright (1875), 13 Cox C.C. 171 640
Rex v. Thomson, [1912] 3 K.B. 19 641
Home v. Corbeil, [1955] 4 D.L.R. 750 642
R. v. Blastland [1986] A.C. 41 644

(vi) Business Records

Regina v. Vanlergerghe (1979), 6 C.R. (3d) 222 654
Regina v. McMullen (1979), 47 C.C.C. (2d) 499 655

Civil Evidence Act (U.K.); Computer Evidence (S. Africa) 661
Wood (1983), 76 Cr. App. R. 23 662

8. Confessions and Pre-Trial Statements

(i) General

Piché v. The Queen (1971), S.C.R. 23 665

(ii) Persons in Authority

Regina v. Towler (1968), 5 C.R.N.S. 55 668
Regina v. Pettipiece (1972), 18 C.R.N.S. 236 669
Rothman v. The Queen (1981), 1 S.C.R. 640 673
Regina v. Collins (1976), 29 C.C.C. (2d) 304 676
Perras v. The Queen (1973), 11 C.C.C. (2d) 245 678
Regina v. Stewart (1989), 54 C.C.C. (2d) 93 680
Regina v. Lerke (1986), 24 C.C.C. (3d) 129

(iii) The Voir Dire

Thiffault v. The King (1933), 60 C.C.C. 97 691

(iv) Need for Voir Dire

Powell (1976), 33 C.R.N.S. 323 694
Erven (1979), 6 C.R. (3d) 97 696
Price (1981) 59 C.C.C. (2d) 367 (Ont. Co. Ct.) 707
Park (1981), 59 C.C.C. (2d) 385) (S.C.C.) 709

(v) Timing of the Voir Dire

Regina v. Bruno (1976), 27 C.C.C. (2d) 318 713

(vi) Voluntariness

Ibrahim v. The King, [1941] A.C. 599 714
Horvath v. The Queen (1979), 44 C.C.C. (2d) 385 717
Ward v. R. (1979), 7 C.R. (3d) 153 725
R. v. Rothman (1981), 35 N.R. 485 728
R. v. Emile (1988), 42 C.C.C. (3d) 408 741
R. v. Woolley (1988), 40 C.C.C. (3d) 193 752
Baig v. The Queen (1988), 37 C.C.C. (3d) 193 759
Regina v. Logan et al. (1989), 43 C.C.C. (3d) 567 761

(vii) Charter Cases

Clarkson v. R (1988) 50 C.R. (3d) 289 784
R. Manninen (1987) 34 C.C.C. (3d) 385 790

(viii) Truth of Confession

R. v. Hammond, [1941] 3 All E.R. 318 796
R. v. Hnedish (1958), 26 W.W.R. 685 798
R. v. De Clerq, [1968] S.C.R. 902 800
R. v. Wong Kam-Ming, [1979] 2 W.L.R. 81 804

(ix) Confessions Confirmed by Subsequent Facts

R. v. St. Lawrence (1949), 93 C.C.C. 376 809
R. v. Wray (1970), 11 C.R.N.S. 235 812

(x) Use of Confessions

R. v. Jackson (1980), 57 C.C.C. (2d) 154 819
R. v. Herodotou & Boulougouris (1979), 6 C.R. (3d) 336 824
R. v. Ma, Ho & Lai (1979), 6 C.R. (3d) 325 828

(xi) Use of Voir Dire Evidence at Trial

R. v. Van Dongen (1975), 31 C.R.N.S. 832
R. v. Magdish, Bennett & Sweet (1978 41 C.C.C. (2d) 392 837
R. v. Brophy (1981), 2 All E.R. 705 838
R. v. Tarrant (1982), 63 C.C.C. (2d) 385 841

(xii) Adopted Statements and Silence

Chapdelaine v. The King (1935, 63 C.C.C. 5 843
Regina v. Eden, [1970] 3 C.C.C. 280 844
R. v. Sweeney (No. 2) (1977), 35 C.C.C. (2d) 245 846
R. v. Christie, [1914] A.C. 545 849
R. v. Sayegh (No. 3) (1982), 69 C.C.C. (2d) 84 851

(xiii) Consciousness of Guilt and Lies

R. v. Burdick (1975) 27 C.C.C. (2d) 497 854
Sparrow v. R. (1979), 12 C.R. (3d) 158 857

(xiv) Conditional Admissibility

R. v. Carter (1982), 67 C.C.C. (2d) 568 859

(xv) Guilty Plea

R. v. Dietrich (1970) 11 C.R.N.S. 22 861
R. v. Pentiluk & MacDonald (1975), 28 C.R.N.S. 324 864

(xvi) Young Offenders Act

R. v. J.J. (1989), 43 C.C.C. (3d) 257 867

9. Admissions

Yorkton v. Morley (1967), 66 D.L.R. (2d) 37 873
Strand Electric Ltd. [1969] 2 C.C.C. 264 875

10. Privilege

Slavutych v. Baker (1977), 38 C.R.N.S. 306 877
Descoteaux v. Mierzwinski, (1982), 44 N.R. 462 881
Shenton v. Tyler [1939] 1 Ch. 620 885
Rumping v. Director of Public Prosecutions 887
Regina v. St-Jean (1976), 34 C.R.N.S. 889
R. v. Akey and Akey, (1980), 12 C.R. (3d) 240 891
R. v. Jean and Piesinger, 7 C.R. (3d) 333; (1980) 16 C.R. (3d) 193 894
Lloyd and Lloyd v. The Queen, 64 C.C.C.(2d) 169 896
Reference re Legislative Privilege (1978), 39 C.C.C. (2d) 222 898
Solicitor General v. Royal Commission (1982), 62 C.C.C. (3d) 513 902
Dubois v. R. (1986) 22 C.C.C. (3d) 513 906

11. State Secrets

Duncan v. Cammell, Laird, [1942] A.C. 624 915
Conway v. Rimmer, [1963] A.C. 910 918
Mannix (1982), 126 D.L.R. (3d) 155 923
Re Goguen (1982) 10 C.C.C. (3d) 492 926
Carey v. The Queen (1987), 30 C.C.C. (3d) 498 938

12. Illegally Obtained Evidence

Kuruma [1955], A.C. 197 950
Sang [1980], A.C. 402 962
Lawrie v. Muir [1950], S.L.T. 37 966
Bunning v. Cross (1978), 52 A.L.J.R. 561 967
Criminal Code Sèctions 189, 193 968

Das (1979), 47 C.C.C. (2d) 194 970

12a. Charter Cases

Hunter v. Southam, (1984) 14 C.C.C. (3d) 97 972
Collins, (1987) 33 C.C.C. (3d) 1 (S.C.C.) 982
Therens, (1985) 45 C.R. (3d) 97 992
Strachan, (1989), 46 C.C.C. (3d) 479 1010

13. Corroboration

Criminal Code Section 274 1022
Baskerville, [1916] 2 K.B. 658 1022
Ethier, [1959] O.R. 533 1024
Warkentin (1976), 30 C.C.C. (2d) 1 1027
Vetrovec (1982), 67 C.C.C. (2d) 1 1031
Paquette v. Chubb (1989), 65 O.R. (2d) 321 1040

14. Real Evidence

Yachuk v. Blais, [1944] O.W.N. 412 1050
Draper v. Jacklyn, [1968] 2 O.R. 683 1051

15. Judicial Notice

Varcoe v. Lee, [1944] O.W.N. 412 1054

16. Miscellaneous Problems in the Trial Process

Cooper, (1977) 34 C.C.C. (2d) 18 1058
LeMay, [1952] 1 S.C.R. 232 1064
Browne v. Dunn, (1893) 6 R. 67 1068
Dyck, [1970] 2 C.C.C. 283 1070
Mete, (1973) 22 C.R.N.S. 387 1071
Angelantoni, (1975) 31 C.R.N.S. 342 1074
Dobberthien, (1973), 13 C.C.C. (2d) 513 1075
Sparre, (1978) 37 C.C.C. (2d) 495 1079